

California Energy Commission
STAFF REPORT

LOCALIZED HEALTH IMPACTS REPORT

Addendum 12 for Projects With Location Changes Awarded
Funding Through the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and
Vehicle Technology Program Under Solicitation PON-11-602
– Alternative Fuels Infrastructure: Electric, Natural Gas,
Propane, E85, and Diesel Substitutes Terminals

California Energy Commission

Edmund G. Brown Jr., Governor



May 2017 | CEC-600-2015-012-AD12

California Energy Commission

Patrick Brecht
Primary Author

Esther Odufuwa
Sharon Purewal
Project Managers

John P. Butler II
Office Manager
ZERO-EMISSION VEHICLE AND INFRASTRUCTURE OFFICE

John Y. Kato
Deputy Director
FUELS AND TRANSPORTATION DIVISION

Robert P. Oglesby
Executive Director

DISCLAIMER

Staff members of the California Energy Commission prepared this report. As such, it does not necessarily represent the views of the Energy Commission, its employees, or the State of California. The Energy Commission, the State of California, its employees, contractors and subcontractors make no warrant, express or implied, and assume no legal liability for the information in this report; nor does any party represent that the uses of this information will not infringe upon privately owned rights. This report has not been approved or disapproved by the Energy Commission nor has the Commission passed upon the accuracy or adequacy of the information in this report.

ADDENDUM 12

The *Localized Health Impacts (LHI) Report for Selected Projects Awarded Funding Through the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Vehicle Technology Program Under Solicitation PON-11-602* was posted April 27, 2012 (CEC-600-2012-004)¹. The addendum LHI for PON-11-602 was posted September 21, 2012 (CEC-600-2012-004-AD)². This addendum applies the same localized health impacts assessment method. Two project proposers are requesting location changes. Under fuel category E85, RTC Fuels, LLC dba Pearson Fuels, has proposed one new site location which replaces a previously proposed station location for the “19 Pearson Fuels E85 Stations” project. Under the Electric Vehicle Supply Equipment category, South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) proposes 35 backup electric vehicle charging station locations which are not replacing previously proposed station locations. Electric vehicle charger type and quantity are unchanged from the original proposal. The original and newly proposed locations are described in Table 1, along with environmental justice (EJ) indicators³.

Table 1: Original and New Site Locations for Pearson Fuels and South Coast Air Quality Management District, Along With Environmental Justice Indicators

Original Site Locations	New Site Locations	EJ Indictors for New Locations
E85 Fuel Category		
Pearson Fuels 6357 Eastern Avenue Bell Gardens, CA 90201	Pearson Fuels 30072 Crown Valley Parkway Laguna Niguel, CA 92677	None
Electric Vehicle Supply Equipment Category		
Not applicable	SCAQMD Albertsons Banning	Minority, Age,

1 Baronas, Jean, 2012. *Localized Health Impacts Report*. California Energy Commission, Fuels and Transportation Division. Publication Number: CEC-600-2012-004.

2 Baronas, Jean, 2012. *Localized Health Impacts Report*. California Energy Commission, Fuels and Transportation Division. Publication Number: CEC-600-2012-004-AD.

3 The EJ indicators follow: (i.) minority subset represents more than 30 percent of a given city's population (2010), (ii.) city's poverty exceeds California's poverty level of 15.3 percent (2015), (iii.) city's unemployment rate exceeds California's unemployment rate of 4.9 percent as of March 2017, and (iv.) city's percentage of persons younger than 5 years of age or older than 65 years of age is 20 percent higher than California's average. For the entire state, the percentage of persons under the age of 5 years is 6.8 percent, and the percentage of persons over the age of 65 years is 11.4 percent.

Original Site Locations	New Site Locations	EJ Indicators for New Locations
	300 South Highlands Avenue #7 Banning, CA 92220	and Poverty
Not applicable	SCAQMD Bellflower-Parking District 1 16721 Bellflower Avenue Bellflower, CA 90706	Minority and Poverty
Not applicable	SCAQMD Beverly Hills Parking Garage 221 Crescent Drive Beverly Hills, CA 91020	Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Cerritos 12701 Towne Center Drive Cerritos, CA 90703	Minority and Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD The Shops at Chino Hills 13920 City Center Drive Chino Hills, CA 91709	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD 14250 Peyton Drive Chino Hills, CA 91709	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Vons Costa Mesa 185 East 17 th Street Costa Mesa, CA 92627	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Vons Eastvale 6170 Hammer Avenue Eastvale, CA 91752	Minority and Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD DDR Falcon Ridge Town Center 15218-15320 Summit Avenue Fontana, CA 92336	Minority, Age, Poverty, and Unemployment
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Foothill Ranch 26502 Towne Center Drive Foothill Ranch, CA 92610	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Albertson Gardena 1735 Artesia Boulevard Gardena, CA 90248	Minority and Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD Slater Bros. Markets 22201 Barton Road Grand Terrace, CA 92313	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Hemet 1231 South Sanderson Avenue Hemet, CA 92545	Minority, Poverty, and Unemployment

Original Site Locations	New Site Locations	EJ Indicators for New Locations
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Huntington Beach 8230 Talbert Avenue Huntington Beach, CA 92646	Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD Vons La Crescenta 3233 Foothill Boulevard La Crescenta (Glendale), CA 91214	Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD Pavilions Laguna Beach 600 North Pacific Coast Highway Laguna Beach, CA 92651	Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart La Habra 1340 South Beach Boulevard La Habra, CA 90631	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Pavilions Newport Beach 21181 Newport Coast Drive Newport Beach, CA 92657	Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Orange 2300 North Tustin Street Orange, CA 92865	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Perris 1800 North Perris Boulevard Perris, CA 92571	Minority, Age, Poverty, and Unemployment
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Porter Ranch 19821 Rinaldi Street Porter Ranch, CA 91326	None
Not applicable	SCAQMD Albertsons Rancho Cucamonga 11358 Kenyon Way Rancho Cucamonga, CA 91701	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Goodwins Organic 191 West Big Springs Road Riverside, CA 92507	Minority, Poverty, and Unemployment
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Riverside 6250 Valley Springs Parkway Riverside, CA 92507	Minority, Poverty, and Unemployment
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart San Jacinto 1861 South San Jacinto Avenue San Jacinto, CA 92583	Minority, Age, Poverty, and Unemployment
Not applicable	SCAQMD 1670 Lincoln Boulevard Santa Monica, CA 90404	Age

Original Site Locations	New Site Locations	EJ Indicators for New Locations
Not applicable	SCAQMD Vons Santa Monica 1311 Wilshire Boulevard Santa Monica, CA 90403	Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD Bristol Farms Santa Monica 3105 Wilshire Boulevard Santa Monica, CA 90403	Age
Not applicable	SCAQMD Bristol Farms South Pasadena 606 Fair Oaks Avenue South Pasadena, CA 91030	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Walmart Southgate 4651 Firestone Boulevard South Gate, CA 90280	Minority, Age, Poverty, and Unemployment
Not applicable	SCAQMD Vons Upland 81 West Foothill Boulevard Upland, CA 91786	Minority and Poverty
Not applicable	SCAQMD Eastland Center 2753 East Eastland Center Drive West Covina, CA 91791	Minority and Unemployment
Not applicable	SCAQMD Vons Whittier Whittwood Town Center 15740 La Forge Street Whittier, CA 90603	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Rio Honda College 3600 Workman Mill Road Whittier, CA 90601	Minority
Not applicable	SCAQMD Albertsons Wildomar 23893 Clinton Keith Road Wildomar, CA 92595	Minority and Unemployment

Source: California Energy Commission staff

Air Quality and EJ Indicators

All proposed location changes are in nonattainment zones for ozone, particulate matter (PM⁴) 2.5, and PM 10. If a project site is in a nonattainment zone and has more than one

⁴ "Particulate matter" is unburned fuel particles that form smoke or soot and stick to lung tissue when inhaled. The numbers stand for "microns in diameter."

EJ indicator, as shown in Table 1, with detail in Table 2, it is considered a high-risk community, according to the Environmental Justice Screening Method⁵. According to staff's assessment, Banning, Bellflower, Cerritos, Eastvale, Fontana, Gardena, Hemet, Perris, Riverside, San Jacinto, South Gate, Upland, West Covina, and Wildomar are considered high-risk communities.

Location Analysis and Community Impacts

Based on the staff's assessment of the proposed station locations, it is expected that none of the surrounding communities would be disproportionately impacted by the projects. While overall air quality depends on several factors, the Energy Commission expects that air quality will improve over time due to both electric vehicles and those vehicles using E85 (ethanol fuel blend), which will be replacing California reformulated gasoline (RFG). Replacing RFG will decrease criteria pollutants and toxic air contaminants, which will benefit surrounding communities, especially those at risk.

⁵ California Air Resources Board (ARB), *Air Pollution and Environmental Justice, Integrating Indicators of Cumulative Impact and Socio-Economic Vulnerability Into Regulatory Decision-Making*, 2010. (Sacramento, California) Contract authors: Manuel Pastor Jr., Ph.D., Rachel Morello-Frosch, Ph.D., and James Sadd, Ph.D.

Table 2: EJ Indicators Compared With California

Yellow highlighted percentages indicate EJ indicators

An asterisk may signify a default to city and/or county demographics and/or labor information.

	Below Poverty Level (2015)	Black Persons (2010)	American Indian and/or Alaska Native (2010)	Asian and/or Pacific Islander (2010)	Persons of Hispanic or Latino Origin (2010)	Persons Under 5 Years of Age (2010)	Persons Over 65 Years of Age (2010)	Unemployment (March 2017)
California	15.3%	6.2%	1.0%	13.0%	37.6%	6.8%	11.4%	4.9%
EJ Indicators	>15.3%	>30%	>30%	>30%	>30%	>8.16%	>13.8%	>4.9%
Banning	21.2%	7.3%	2.2%	5.2%	41.1%	6.2%	25.9%	4.8%
Bellflower	17.9%	14.0%	1.0%	11.6%	52.3%	7.6%	8.6%	4.1%
Beverly Hills	8.9%	2.2%	0.1%	8.9%	5.7%	3.8%	19.1%	4.1%
Cerritos	4.8%	6.9%	0.3%	61.9%	12.0%	3.9%	17.7%	3.2%
Chino Hills	6.5%	4.6%	0.5%	30.3%	29.1%	5.8%	7.0%	3.8%
Costa Mesa	14.5%	1.5%	0.5%	7.9%	35.8%	6.5%	9.2%	3.7%
Eastvale	5.9%	9.7%	0.5%	24.2%	40.0%	9.7%	4.7%	3.6%
Fontana	16.1%	10.0%	1.0%	6.6%	66.8%	8.6%	5.7%	5.6%
Foothill Ranch*	12.7%	2.1%	0.6%	20.1%	34.4%	6.0%	13.6%	3.7%
Gardena	15.0%	24.4%	0.6%	26.2%	37.7%	6.3%	14.1%	4.3%
Grand Terrace	9.9%	5.6%	1.0%	6.5%	39.1%	6.3%	12.5%	3.6%
Hemet	26.0%	6.4%	1.6%	3.0%	35.8%	7.2%	22.1%	7.6%
Huntington Beach	9.4%	1.0%	0.5%	11.1%	17.1%	5.1%	14.2%	3.5%
La Crescenta (Glendale)	14.6%	1.3%	0.3%	16.4%	17.4%	4.8%	15.6%	4.2%
Laguna Beach	6.7%	0.8%	0.3%	3.6%	7.3%	3.3%	18.3%	2.8%
Laguna Niguel	6.6%	1.2%	0.3%	8.7%	13.9%	5.1%	13.0%	3.3%
La Habra	13.2%	1.7%	0.9%	9.4%	57.2%	7.2%	10.9%	4.2%
Newport Beach	7.1%	0.7%	0.3%	7.0%	7.2%	3.8%	19.0%	3.0%
Orange	13.2%	1.6%	0.7%	11.3%	38.1%	6.4%	10.7%	3.4%
Perris	25.3%	12.1%	0.9%	3.6%	71.8%	10.0%	4.9%	8.0%
Porter Ranch*	N/A	1.8%	0.7%	26.8%	7.5%	6.6%	10.5%	4.6%
Rancho Cucamonga	8.8%	9.2%	0.7%	10.4%	34.9%	6.2%	7.9%	3.8%
Riverside	18.8%	7.0%	1.1%	7.4%	49.0%	7.2%	8.6%	5.2%
San Jacinto	20.4%	6.6%	1.8%	3.0%	52.3%	8.8%	10.6%	8.2%
Santa Monica	11.3%	3.9%	0.4%	9.0%	13.1%	4.1%	15.0%	3.7%
South Pasadena	7.8%	3.0%	0.4%	31.1%	18.6%	5.2%	12.1%	3.0%
South Gate	20.0%	0.9%	0.9%	0.8%	94.8%	8.4%	7.0%	5.7%

	Below Poverty Level (2015)	Black Persons (2010)	American Indian and/or Alaska Native (2010)	Asian and/or Pacific Islander (2010)	Persons of Hispanic or Latino Origin (2010)	Persons Under 5 Years of Age (2010)	Persons Over 65 Years of Age (2010)	Unemployment (March 2017)
Upland	15.5%	7.3%	0.7%	8.4%	38.0%	6.2%	12.1%	3.8%
West Covina	10.3%	4.5%	1.0%	25.8%	53.2%	6.0%	12.1%	5.3%
Whittier	12.5%	1.3%	1.3%	3.8%	65.7%	6.7%	11.7%	3.4%
Wildomar	15.0%	3.3%	1.2%	4.5%	35.3%	7.1%	10.6%	5.5%

Sources: Unemployment information from the State of California, Employee Development Department Labor Market Information Div.: <http://www.labormarketinfo.edd.ca.gov/data/unemployment-and-labor-force.html#Tool>. U.S. Census Bureau, <http://www.census.gov/quickfacts/table/PST045215/0664000.06.00> and http://factfinder.census.gov/faces/nav/jsf/pages/community_facts.xhtml.

APPENDIX A:

Localized Health Impact Report Assessment Method

Based on the California Energy Commission's interpretation of the *California ARB AQIP Guidelines*, this *LHI Report* assesses the potential impacts to communities as a result of the projects proposed by the ARFVTP. This report is prepared under the *California ARB AQIP Guidelines, California Code of Regulations, Title 13, Motor Vehicles, Chapter 8.1 (CCR § 2343)*:

“(6) Localized health impacts must be considered when selecting projects for funding. The funding agency must consider environmental justice consistent with state law and complete the following:

(A) For each fiscal year, the funding agency must publish a staff report for review and comment by the public at least 30 calendar days prior to approval of projects. The report must analyze the aggregate locations of the funded projects, analyze the impacts in communities with the most significant exposure to air contaminants or localized air contaminants, or both, including, but not limited to, communities of minority populations or low-income populations, and identify agency outreach to community groups and other affected stakeholders.

(B) Projects must be selected and approved for funding in a publicly noticed meeting.”

This *LHI Report* is not intended to be a detailed environmental health impact analysis of proposed projects nor is it intended to substitute for the environmental review conducted during the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) review. This *LHI Report* includes staff's application of the Environmental Justice Screening Method (EJSM) to identify projects located in areas with social vulnerability indicators and the greatest exposure to air pollution and associated health risks⁶.

The EJSM was developed to identify low-income communities highly affected by air pollution for assessing the impacts of climate change regulations, specifically Assembly Bill 32 (Núñez, Chapter 488, Statutes of 2006), the California Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006. The EJSM integrates data on (i.) exposure to air pollution, (ii.) cancer risk, (iii.) ozone concentration, (iv.) frequency of high ozone days, (v.) race/ethnicity, (vi.) poverty level, (vii.) home ownership, (viii.)

⁶ California Air Resources Board (ARB). *Air Pollution and Environmental Justice, Integrating Indicators of Cumulative Impact and Socio-Economic Vulnerability Into Regulatory Decision-Making*, 2010. (Sacramento, California) Contract authors: Manuel Pastor Jr., Ph.D., Rachel Morello-Frosch, Ph.D., and James Sadd, Ph.D.

median household value, (ix.) educational attainment, and (x.) sensitive populations (populations under 5 years of age or over 65 years of age).

To determine high-risk communities, environmental justice (EJ) indicators for locations of the freight transportation projects at California seaports are compared to data from the U.S. Census Bureau or other public agency. Staff identifies high-risk communities by using a two-part standard. For a community to be considered high-risk, for this assessment, it must meet both Parts 1 and 2 of this standard.

Part 1:

- Communities located in nonattainment air basins for ozone, PM 2.5 or PM 10

Part 2:

- Communities having more than one of the following EJ indicators: (1) minority, (2) poverty, (3) unemployment and (4) high percentage of population under 5 years of age and over 65 years of age. The EJ indicators follow:
 - A minority subset represents more than 30 percent of a given city's population.
 - A city's poverty level exceeds California's poverty level.
 - A city's unemployment rate exceeds California's unemployment rate.
 - The percentage of people living in that city are younger than 5 years of age or older than 65 years of age is 20 percent higher than the average percentage of persons under 5 years of age or over 65 years of age for all of California.